Action No.: A35680131R E-File No.: RCP15COUTUREJ Appeal No.:

# IN THE PROVINCIAL COURT OF ALBERTA JUDICIAL CENTRE OF RED DEER

## HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN

v.

#### JOEY J C G COUTURE

Accused

## PROCEEDINGS

Red Deer, Alberta November 17, 2015

Transcript Management Services, Regional 4909 - 48 Avenue Red Deer, Alberta T4N 3T5

Phone: (403) 340-5235 Fax: (403) 340-7986

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Description		Page
November 17, 2015	Afternoon Session	1
Discussion		1
Certificate of Record		10
Certificate of Transcript		11

1	1 Proceedings taken in the Provincial Court of Alberta, Courthouse, Red Deer, Alberta	
3 4	November 17, 2015	Afternoon Session
5 6 7	Traffic Commissioner Gorsalitz	Justice of the Peace in the Provincial Court of Alberta
8	S. Funk	For the Crown
9	G. Levesque	For the Accused
	R. Sceviour	Court Clerk
11		
12		
13	MR. FUNK:	From the trial docket, surname Couture, first
14	name Joey.	
15		
	Discussion	
17	1 D 1 D 1 D 1 D 1 D 1 D 1 D 1 D 1 D 1 D	
	MR. LEVESQUE:	Good afternoon, Your Honour. My name is
19	•	m counsel for Joey Couture and today I am here
20	•	regulation 158/2013, that's the languages of the
<ul><li>21</li><li>22</li></ul>		
23		
24	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	and if it's consented by the Crown then it can
25	be	and it is consented by the crown then it can
26		
	THE COMMISSIONER:	We
28		
	MR. LEVESQUE:	dealt with.
30		
31	THE COMMISSIONER:	We order interpreters all the time but we
32	usually do it prior to the trial date.	•
33		
34	MR. LEVESQUE:	Well, that is when it's not accepted that will be
35	the procedure.	
36		
37	I have a copy, if you want, of regulation,	here, one fifty
38		
39	THE COMMISSIONER:	Can I see that here, please.
40		
41	MR. LEVESQUE:	158. It's the languages in court regulation.

1	And at paragraph 3, it says:	
2		
3	A judge may, at the request of	a defendant and with the consent of
4	a prosecutor, conduct a proceeding in French.	
5	A 1 41.:	
6 7	And this is only for traffic court.	
8	So before that, the judge had the authorit	y to decide but, unfortunately, now that authority
9	has been taken out of the realm of the jud	•
10	J	
	THE COMMISSIONER:	I believe there is a
12	THE COMMISSIONER.	Tocheve there is a
	MR. LEVESQUE:	to the prosecutor.
14		
15	THE COMMISSIONER:	You are wanting a French-speaking
16	commissioner or do you just want an inte	rpreter?
17		
18	MR. LEVESQUE:	No, we have we have now in Alberta
19	bilingual commissioner and they can produce	ceed they can conduct in English, in French or
20		
21		Crown doesn't consent then it will proceed by
22	interpretation.	stown doesn't consent then it will proceed by
23	merpretation.	
	It's the same if my client would have	would have went went to use both languages
24	•	would have want want to use both languages,
25	section 4 says a judge	
26		
	THE COMMISSIONER:	I believe there was a Queen's Bench decision
28	on this particular point.	
29		
30	MR. LEVESQUE:	The matter is in Queen's Bench, yes
31		
32	THE COMMISSIONER:	No, no, I there was a Queen's Bench
33	decision on whether a traffic court trial co	ould be conducted in French.
34		
35	MR. LEVESQUE:	You're probably referencing to the decision
36	decision of <i>Caron</i> by Justice Eidsvik.	1 7 2
37	200121211 01 000 01 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	
	THE COMMISSIONER:	That might be it.
39	THE COMMISSIONER.	That might be it.
	MD LEVESOUE.	Ry coincidence Justice Eideville is saize of a
	MR. LEVESQUE:	By coincidence, Justice Eidsvik is seize of a Couture, this client of today, with five others
+ I	- DIOCECHIE HIVOLVIIIS IVII. JOEV AND HVE	COULUIC, HIIS CHEHL OF LOUAY, WITH TIVE OFFICES

who are contesting the validity of this regulation that I just quote because --1 2 3 THE COMMISSIONER: Well, if you are saying it is a *Charter* issue, I 4 do not have jurisdiction to deal with that. 5 6 MR. LEVESQUE: Well, that's why I -- after deciding the first request on the language, my second request would be to adjourn a few months to let the 7 8 Queen's Bench decision take place on the validity of regulation 158/2013. And I gave 9 my friend a copy of the finding in Queen's Bench and Justice Eidsvik is seized of the 10 matter. She has already conducted a hearing in May and a phone conference between counsel, also, in September. The filing of the affidavits would be finished this month and 11 12 the constitutional law section of the ministry is reserving their right to proceed to 13 interrogation. 14 15 THE COMMISSIONER: All right. Why are you making this application 16 on the trial date when this matter was first in this court on August 12th? 17 18 MR. LEVESQUE: Well, when I came on August 12 it was agreed with the Crown that today will be the date where I will present the request to the Court to 19 20 see if it will be decided that it will proceed in French, but like I mention, in -- the 21 regulation now make it so that the -- the consent of -- of the prosecutor is needed. So 22 there is a -- a need for the Crown to say yes or no and then we'll -- we can go to the next 23 step and decide that the matter could go in a few months as a matter to be spoken to, and 24 I will be at that time reporting on the status of the file in Queen's Bench. 25 26 MR. FUNK: Sir, I have no problems with consenting. 27 28 THE COMMISSIONER: Well, I have no idea who the French-speaking commissioner is. 29 30 31 MR. LEVESQUE: Are -- are you, over here, under the jurisdiction 32 of Calgary or Edmonton? 33 34 THE COMMISSIONER: Red Deer. 35 36 MR. LEVESQUE: Yeah, but there's a regional service. When there is no bilingual capacity in an area, the judges or the traffic commissioners or justices 37 of the peace --38 39 40 THE COMMISSIONER: Well, there is bilingual you said 41 commissioner, where are they?

1 2 MR. LEVESQUE: Well, I know one. Where? 4 THE COMMISSIONER: 5 6 MR. LEVESQUE: Schwager, in -- in Calgary. And in Airdrie, I have been told by a traffic commissioner there is at least two -- two more justices of the 7 peace. And when there is none, then it could be, like it was before, a justice of the 8 9 criminal court can be assigned. I --10 11 THE COMMISSIONER: So you are saying this regulation is subsequent 12 to the decision of Caron? 13 14 MR. LEVESQUE: Yes, Caron is a while ago and, in fact, the final 15 step is this Friday in the Supreme Court of Canada. And Caron was not deciding section 4 of the Languages Act, which is the use of languages in front of the court, it's only 16 whether the Alberta law could be in French. That's a right that has been taken out in 17 1988 and the Supreme Court will just have to answer whether Alberta had the unilateral 18 right to take this right to --19 20 21 THE COMMISSIONER: And when is the Supreme Court of Canada 22 hearing that? 23 24 MR. LEVESQUE: It is deciding on *Caron*, constitutional section 3 25 of the --26 27 THE COMMISSIONER: When? 28 -- Language Act -- this Friday --29 MR. LEVESQUE: 30 31 THE COMMISSIONER: This Friday. 32 -- at 10 -- 10:00. 33 MR. LEVESQUE: 34 35 THE COMMISSIONER: And they probably will not render their decision 36 for how long? 37 38 MR. LEVESQUE: No, no, the decision is now -- that's the 39 decision on Friday. 40 41 THE COMMISSIONER: Oh, so that -- they are not presenting then, that

```
is when the decision --
 1
 2
 3 MR. LEVESQUE:
                                             No, it has --
 4
 5 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             -- will come down.
 6
 7 MR. LEVESQUE:
                                             -- been argued last February. But that's only
      the law, where it has to be in both languages. This matter is under another section of the
      Languages Act of Alberta, section 4, which says that everybody in Alberta can use French
 9
10
      or English orally.
11
12 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             Do you have the Caron decision with you?
13
                                             If I have what?
14 MR. LEVESQUE:
15
16 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             Do you have the Caron decision with you?
17
18 MR. LEVESQUE:
                                             Not the decision. I can e-mail to -- to you and
      to Crown, if you want. The decision of -- there is many decision. The one pertinent to
19
      this case, the Crown has not appeal it. It's Justice -- it's Judge Anne Brown, March,
20
21
      2011. After four days of hearing where the Crown took the position that there's no right
      to be understood in French in court -- in traffic court, that it's a right to interpretation,
22
23
      Justice -- Judge Anne Brown wrote in both languages. And I can e-mail to the Crown the
      text of her decision that it would be hollow indeed if the right to use one of the two
24
25
      languages specifically authorized --
26
27 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             You do not need to make that argument here,
28
      sir.
29
30 MR. LEVESQUE:
                                             Okay.
31
32 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             I cannot --
33
                                             But I -- I can --
34 MR. LEVESQUE:
35
36 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             I cannot make that decision.
37
                                             -- I can e-mail that decision. And I can e-mail
38 MR. LEVESQUE:
      also the decision of -- of the court --
39
40
41 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             Well, just -- you come before the traffic
```

```
commissioner today and I have --
 1
 2
                                            Yeah.
 3 MR. LEVESQUE:
 4
 5 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             -- no notice from you in terms of this
      application. There is no pleadings filed with the court that I have seen, other than the
 6
 7
      ticket, sir.
 8
                                             Well, it was filed when we came --
 9 MR. LEVESQUE:
10
11 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             Did you file it with the Provincial Court so that
12
      I would have a copy of it?
13
                                             Well, it was given to the Crown --
14 MR. LEVESQUE:
15
16 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             Can you answer my question, please, did you
17
      file it with the court?
18
19 MR. LEVESQUE:
                                            No.
20
21 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             Do you have any other materials on it?
22
                                             Well, it -- it -- it was file with the Crown.
23 MR. LEVESQUE:
24
25 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                            Did you file it with the court, sir?
26
27 MR. LEVESQUE:
                                             Well, I thought that the Crown would have
      mentioned it to -- to -- to the court.
28
29
30 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             Well, it is your application, it is not for them to
31
      submit your documents to the court.
32
33 MR. LEVESQUE:
                                             No, no, but it's for them to say yay or no
      because they have the full power. It's no longer in the hands of the -- unfortunately, of
34
35
      the court.
36
37 THE COMMISSIONER:
                                             But you cannot come before a commissioner
      with no notice asking for this type of a ruling.
38
39
40 MR. LEVESQUE:
                                             Well, the rul --
```

41

1	THE COMMISSIONER:	In what court would that be allowed, sir?
2		
3	MR. LEVESQUE:	the ruling will just decide whether it
4		
5	THE COMMISSIONER:	In what court would
6		
7	MR. LEVESQUE:	will be in French.
8		
9	THE COMMISSIONER:	that be allowed, where you can just walk in
10	and make an application without any noti	ce to the court?
11		
12	MR. LEVESQUE:	Well, that's how it it's been set. Before that
13	we used to go to the counter and ask for	it, now we have to go and and seek a date to
14	present the the request and the Crown	has to say what what they think about it.
15		
16	THE COMMISSIONER:	Okay. I am going to adjourn this matter and
17	we will see what happens, but we will	adjourn it until February 22nd, at 9:30.
18		
19	MR. LEVESQUE:	Pardon me?
20	-	
21	THE COMMISSIONER:	And if you have any materials that you want to
22	submit to this hearing or to the to this	court, then you need to submit them prior to that
23	date	
24		
25	MR. LEVESQUE:	Can you
26		•
	THE COMMISSIONER:	so that the commissioner
28		
29	MR. LEVESQUE:	repeat the
30		· r · · · · ·
	THE COMMISSIONER:	will have an opportunity to review whatever
32		aking that application. If it is resolved by then
33	without recourse to an application to this	
34	without recourse to an appreciation to this	Court, that is inter-
	MR. LEVESQUE:	Resolved by whom?
36	Ma 22 ( 25 Q 6 2 .	The sorved by whom
37	THE COMMISSIONER:	Well, if it is resolved between the two of you
38	and	, on, if it is reserved between the two or you
39	unu	
	MR. LEVESQUE:	Okay.
41	THE DETENCE.	Onuj.
71		

_		
1	THE COMMISSIONER:	the decision from the Supreme Court of
2	Canada, it may be	
3	MD I EVECOUE.	Okov
5	MR. LEVESQUE:	Okay.
6	THE COMMISSIONER:	a most point to make an application to ma
7	THE COMMISSIONER.	a moot point to make an application to me.
	MR. LEVESQUE:	Well well, no, the the Supreme Court
9	decision	wen wen, no, the the Supreme Court
10	decision	
11	THE COMMISSIONER:	Do not I have no idea what they are going to
12	say, sir, because	Do not I have no laca what they are going to
13	say, sir, sectaise	
	MR. LEVESQUE:	Okay.
15	== · == &e=.	
	THE COMMISSIONER:	it has not been rendered yet.
17		,
18	MR. LEVESQUE:	Okay. Which date are you suggesting? I I
19	want to be	
20		
21	THE COMMISSIONER:	February 22nd.
22		
23	MR. LEVESQUE:	The 22nd of February. Can I have a second
24	here to see if I am in Alberta?	
25		
26	That's yes. That's a Monday?	
27		
28	THE COMMISSIONER:	Yes.
29		
	MR. LEVESQUE:	At what time?
31		
	THE COMMISSIONER:	Nine thirty in the morning.
33		
34	•	re making some kind of a <i>Charter</i> argument, you
35	cannot go before this court.	
36	MD LEVEGOUE	NI ( I CI ( ) I
	MR. LEVESQUE:	Not here, no. The <i>Charter</i> argument, I gave
38		No, it's just to say to to present a what is
39 40	asked by the regulation.	
	THE COMMISSIONER:	All right. So if you have any materials you
+1	THE COMMISSIONER.	711 fight. 50 if you have any materials you

1 2 3	want to submit to the court, you have February	to do it I would say at least by the 15th of
	MR. LEVESQUE:	Okay.
6 7	THE COMMISSIONER:	with similar service on the Crown.
	MR. LEVESQUE:	Yeah. Well, they have it since
	THE COMMISSIONER:	I do not know.
12 13 14	MR. LEVESQUE: another document today.	August and now I gave an extra copy
15 16 17	And I'll just ask the name of my colleacopy of what I'll be filing.	gue so that I'll know which colleague to send a
18 19	(NO AUDIBLE RESPONSE)	
20 21	MR. LEVESQUE:	Okay. Thank you very much.
22 23	THE COURT CLERK:	So that will just be to speak to on that date?
24 25	THE COMMISSIONER:	Yes.
	PROCEEDINGS ADJOURNED UNTIL 9:30	) AM, FEBRUARY 22, 2016
28 29		
30 31		
32 33		
34		
35 36		
37		
38 39		
40 41		
71		

## 1 Certificate of Record

2 3

I, Roxanne Sceviour, certify that this recording is the record made of the evidence in proceedings in Provincial Court, held in courtroom 001, at the Red Deer Lodge, Red Deer, Alberta, on the 17th day November, 2015, and that I was the court official in charge of the sound-recording machine during the proceedings.

#### 1 Certificate of Transcript I, Pam Simmons, certify (a) I transcribed the record, which was recorded by a sound-recording machine, to the best of my skill and ability and the foregoing pages are a complete and accurate transcript of the contents of the record, and (b) the Certificate of Record for these proceedings was included orally on the record and is transcribed in this transcript. Digitally Certified: 2015-11-18 16:21:49 Pam Simmons, Transcriber Order No. 11237-15-1 35 Pages: 36 Lines: 37 Characters: 38 — 39 File Locator: a76a58128e4a11e59e8f0017a4770810 40 Digital Fingerprint: 4d8516c3967f788c1c48d4942a2da3549660dfc31a27398e0dbe186ac4e418a9 41 —

Detailed Transcript Statistics	
Order No. 11237-15-1	
Page Statistics	
Title Pages:	1
ToC Pages:	1
Transcript Pages:	11
Total Pages:	13
Line Statistics	
Title Page Lines:	50
ToC Lines:	4
Transcript Lines:	442
Total Lines:	496
Visible Character Count Statistics	
Title Page Characters:	476
ToC Characters:	83
Transcript Characters:	11120
Total Billable Characters:	11679
Multi-Take Adjustment: (-) Duplicated Title Page Characters	11203